

**A Review
Of
Members' Allowances
For
Trafford Council**

**A Report by the
Independent Remuneration
Panel**

**Declan Hall PhD (Chair)
Kal Kay
Ralph Rudden (B.E.M)**

May 2023

Executive Summary – Recommendations

The Table below sets out the Panel's recommendations for the Basic Allowance and SRAs (2023/34), including total number of SRAs and maximum amounts payable.

Trafford 2023 Review	Recommended Maximum Payable 2023/24				
POSITION	No Paid	Basic Allowance	Methodology	Total P/Mbr (BA+SRA)	Sub Total Per Category
BASIC ALLOWANCE	63	£10,076	130 days - 35% PSD X £119.24		£634,788
SPECIAL RESPONSIBILITY ALLOWANCES		SRA annual			
EXECUTIVE					
Leader	1	£31,236	3.1 X BA		£31,236
Leader GMCA SRA	1	£10,237	NA	£51,549	£10,237
Deputy Leader	1	£20,303	65% X Leader's SRA	£30,379	£20,303
Other Cabinet Members	8	£15,618	50% X Leader's SRA	£25,694	£124,944
Lead Member	1	£7,809	50% X Executive Members SRA		£7,809
OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY (O&S)					
Chairs Scrutiny Committees	3	£8,590	27.5% X Leader's SRA	£18,666	£25,770
Vice Chairs Scrutiny Committees	3	£2,577	30% X Chair's SRA	£12,653	£7,731
REGULATORY					
Chair Planning & Development Management Committee	1	£10,933	35% X Leader's SRA	£21,009	£10,933
Vice Chair Planning & Development Management Committee	1	£3,280	30% X Chair's SRA	£13,356	£3,280
Chair Licensing Committee	1	£10,933	35% X Leader's SRA	£21,009	£10,933
Vice Chair Licensing Committee	1	£3,280	30% X Chair's SRA	£13,356	£3,280
Chair Accounts & Audit Committee	1	£8,590	27.5% X Leader's SRA	£18,666	£8,590
Vice Chair Account & Audit Committee	1	£2,577	30% X Chair's SRA	£12,653	£2,577
Chair Employment Committee	1	£7,809	25% X Leader's SRA	£17,885	£7,809
Vice Chair Employment Committee	1	£2,343	30% X Chair's SRA	£12,419	£2,343
Chair Standards Committee	1	£2,343	7.5% X Leader's SRA	£12,419	£2,343
OPPOSITION POSTS					
Leader Main Opposition Group	1	£10,933	35% X Leader's SRA	£21,009	£10,933
Deputy Leader Main Opposition Group (where Group has 25% of Council membership)	1	£3,280	30% X Group Leader's SRA	£13,356	£3,280
Shadow Executive Members (where Group has 25% of Council membership)	8	£2,187	20% X Group Leader's SRA	£12,263	£17,496
Leader(s) Minority Opposition Groups (only payable when have at least 4 Members)	2	£3,142	10% X Leader's SRA	£13,218	£6,284
Sub Total - Basic Allowance	63				£634,788
Sub Total - SRAs	39				£318,111
Total (BA+SRAs)					£952,899

The IRP also recommends:

Number of Lead Member SRAs payable

That the Council pay no more than four Lead Members at any one time

Leader of the Main Opposition Group

That the current criteria of reaching 25% of Council membership for the SRA to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group to be payable is removed

Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group

That the SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group is only payable if the Group has reached 25% of Council membership

Shadow Executive Members

That the SRA for the Shadow Executive Members is only payable if the Main Opposition Group has reached 25% of Council membership

Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups

That the SRA for the Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups is only payable if Group as at least four Members

Members appointed to GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee (reimbursed by GMCA)

That the Council pays the following SRAs to the Members it appoints to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee (until the GMCA acquires to powers to pay the posts itself) as follows:

- The full Member (X1): annual SRA of £3,228
- The Substitute Member (X1): an annual standing SRA of £536 + a variable SRA of £134.52 for each meeting attended of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee and related Task & Finish Groups
- If a Trafford Member is Chair: an annual SRA of £9,684
- If a Trafford Member is Vice Chair (and GMCA appoints): an annual SRA of £4,035

Discontinuation of SRAs

That the following SRAs are discontinued:

- Deputy Executive Members
- Chair of Licensing Sub Committees
- Members undertaking Social Services visits
- Shadow Deputy Executive Members
- Shadow Lead Member for Education
- Opposition Spokespersons for Planning & Development Management and Licensing

SRAs considered but not recommended

That Planning & Development Management Committee Members are not paid an SRA

Clarifying the SRA schedule

That the SRA paid to the Chairs and Vice Chairs of the Scrutiny, Accounts & Audit and Employment Committees are individually listed.

Discontinuation of the 50% of second SRA payable – replace with 1 SRA only rule and exceptions

That the payment to a Member of a second SRA at 50% is discontinued. In its place a clarification should be inserted into the Allowances scheme that states that no Member is able to be paid more than 1 SRA regardless of the number of remunerated posts they may hold with the exception of the additional SRAs paid under the 2011 GMCA Order.

The Co-optees' Allowance

The current Co-optees' Allowance is maintained as follows:

- Co-optees on Standards Committee: £834
- Other Co-optees: £1,247

The Dependants' Carers' Allowance (DCA)

That the DCA is maintained but there are two types of care identified to be paid at the following maximum rates:

- Child care: maximum hourly rate paid at real living wage (currently £10.90)
- Elderly/disabled care: maximum rate paid at the hourly rate charged by Trafford Council Social Services Department for a Home Carer

The IRP also recommends that the current annual cap of £89 per week be discontinued and replaced by a cap of a maximum of 20 hours per week claimable. Also, all claims should continue to be to be receipted. Claims can be made where a carer is an informal babysitter as long as receipts are provided and they are not a member of the claimants household.

Travel and Subsistence Allowances - Within the Council

That the Basic Allowance continues to be deemed inclusive of all in-Council travel and subsistence costs (with two exceptions – see below) and that Schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is amended to reflect this situation.

The Planning Development Control Travel Allowance - Within the Council

That the Planning Development Control Travel Allowance is maintained and reset at £480 per year.

Claiming Travel - Within the Council where there is a medical reason

That schedule 2 of the allowances scheme should be clarified to permit that where a Member is unable to attend an in-authority approved duty by car or public transport for medical reasons then they are exempt from the general prohibition by Members to claim in-authority travel allowances. In this case, they are able to claim travel expenses for attending in-authority approved duties if they have to travel by taxi.

Subsistence Allowances - Outwith the Council

That schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is clarified to state that where a Member is required to attend an approved duty outwith the Council then it is expected that where possible all relevant Subsistence and overnight accommodation should be pre-booked through Democratic Services. When this is not possible then the maximum rates can be claimed (all supported by receipts) are as follows

- Meals allowance maximum of £20.72 within a 24 hour period
- Overnight accommodation maximum of £80

- Overnight accommodation (in London or at a Conference) maximum of £90

Travel Allowances - Outwith the Council

That schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is clarified to state that where a Member is required to attend an approved duty outwith the Council then it is expected that where possible travel should be on public transport at standards rates and should be pre-booked through Democratic Services. If travel by public transport is not possible or cost effective then the applicable mileage rates are applicable:

Mode of Travel	First 10,000 business miles in the tax year	Each business mile over 10,000 miles in the tax year
Cars and vans (including Hybrid or Electric vehicles)	45p	25p
Motor cycles	24p	24p
Bicycles	20p	20p

Passenger payments – cars and vans

5p per passenger per business mile for carrying fellow Member or Council employee in a car or van (including hybrid/electric vehicles) up to a maximum of 5 passengers

Indexation

That the following indices are applied to the allowances paid to Members and appointees of Trafford Council:

- **Basic Allowance, SRAs (including those paid in accordance with the GMCA 2011 Order), Co-optees' and Subsistence Allowances:**
 - Indexed to the annual percentage salary increase for local government staff (*at spinal column point 43*) as agreed each year by the National Joint Council for Local Government Services and applicable to the same year it applies to Officers but with an implementation date from the start of the municipal rather than financial year.
- **Mileage Allowance (Outwith only):**
 - Members' mileage allowances rates indexed to HMRC Approved Mileage Allowance Payment rates.
- **The Dependants' Carers' Allowance:**
 - Child care: maximum hourly rate indexed to the real living wage
 - Elderly/disabled care: maximum rate indexed to the hourly rate charged by Trafford Council Social Services Department for a Home Carer

The IRP also recommends that indexation should run for four years (2023-2027), which is the maximum length of time permitted by the 2003 Regulations. For authority for indexation to be extended beyond the fourth anniversary of the establishment of the new scheme of allowances the Council is required to first seek advice from the IRP.

Implementation

That the recommendations contained in this report are adopted from the 1st April 2023.

A Review
Of
Members' Allowances for Trafford Council
By the
Independent Remuneration Panel
May 2023

Regulatory context

1. This report is a synopsis of the deliberations and recommendations made by the Independent Remuneration Panel (the IRP or Panel) for Trafford Council to advise the Council on its Members' Allowances scheme.
2. The IRP was convened under The Local Authorities' (Members' Allowances) (England) Regulations 2003 (SI 1021) ("the 2003 Regulations"). These regulations, which arise out of the relevant provisions contained in the Local Government Act 2000, require all local authorities to establish and maintain an advisory Independent [Members] Remuneration Panel to review and provide advice on Members' allowances on a periodic basis.
3. All Councils are required to convene their IRP and seek its advice before they make any changes or amendments to their Members' Allowances Scheme. They must 'pay regard' to their IRPs recommendations before setting a new or amended Members' Allowances Scheme.
4. On this particular occasion, the IRP was reconvened under the 2003 Regulations [10. (5)], which states:

Where an authority has regard to an index for the purpose of annual adjustment of allowances it must not rely on that index for longer than a period of four years

- before seeking a further recommendation from the independent remuneration panel established in respect of that authority on the application of an index to its scheme.
5. It is this mechanism, known as the '4-year rule', that ensures IRPs are convened at least every four years if a council wishes to continue indexing their allowances. Although the main allowances are not currently indexed as authority to do so lapsed in 2021/22 if the Council wishes to go forward within indexation it must seek further advice from its IRP before it does so.
 6. The 4-year rule also provides an opportunity for IRPs to publicly scrutinise their councils' allowances schemes and enhance public accountability. In addition, as the allowances scheme has not been fundamentally reviewed for 20 years the IRP was also asked to review the whole scheme of allowances.

Terms of Reference

7. The Trafford IRP is to review the Council's Members' Allowances Scheme in accordance with the requirement of the 2003 Members' Allowances Regulations (21. (1)), which state

An independent remuneration panel shall produce a report in relation to the authority or authorities in respect of which it was established, making recommendations —

- a) as to the responsibilities or duties in respect of which the following should be available:
 - Special Responsibility Allowance
 - Travelling and Subsistence allowance; and the duties for which a Travelling and Subsistence allowance can be paid
 - Co-optees' Allowance;
- b) as to the amount of such allowances and as to the amount of Basic Allowance;
- c) as to whether Dependants' Carers' Allowance should be payable to members of an authority, and as to the amount of such an allowance;
- d) as to whether, in the event that the scheme is amended at any time so as to affect an allowance payable for the year in which the amendment is made, payment of allowances may be backdated in accordance with regulation 10(6);
- e) as to whether adjustments to the level of allowances may be determined according to an index and if so which index and how long that index should apply, subject to a maximum of four years, before its application is reviewed.

In arriving at its recommendations the IRP took into account

- I. The views of Members both oral and written
- II. Factual briefings from relevant Council Officers
- III. Allowances paid across the 10 Greater Manchester Councils
- IV. The broader financial context facing local government in general

Membership of the Independent Remuneration Panel

8. In accordance with the decision of Trafford Council on 17th March 2021, the Director of Law and Public Services in consultation with the Mayor was authorised to appointed a new IRP, consisting of the following appointees:
- Dr Declan Hall (Chair): an independent consultant specialising in members' allowances and support and a former lecturer in local government and politics at the Institute of Local Government, The University of Birmingham.
 - Kal Kay: : CFO Trafford College Group, a qualified accountant and professional background in the public sector, and Chair of the Finance Committee at NHS Greater Manchester
 - Ralph Rudden (B.E.M): A Trafford resident, a Royal Marine by professional background, Chair Stronger Communities Board and Chair Our Sale West
9. The IRP was supported by Ian Cockill, Senior Governance Officer, who was the organisational lead in facilitating and supporting the work of the IRP.

The Review Process and Methodology

10. The IRP met in person at Trafford Council Town Hall on 31st January and 1st February 2023 to consider all the written evidence and data and receive factual briefings on the Council and how it operates from relevant Officers. It was during this time that a representative range of Members met with the IRP to discuss their roles and responsibilities and to raise any issues of concern. Any Member not invited but who wanted to meet with the IRP was accommodated.
11. To ensure that all elected Members were able to exercise their voice in this review they were all sent a short questionnaire through which they could make their views known and raise any concerns directly with the IRP, of which 26 were received. The questionnaire also had the methodological advantage of ensuring all Members were being asked a common set of questions during the interviews, the main point being that all Members had at least one opportunity to exercise their voice during the review.
12. In compliance with the terms of reference and for benchmarking purposes the IRP also took into account the range and levels of allowances paid in comparable local authorities, namely the other Greater Manchester Councils.
13. The full range of interviewees and written information received and considered by the IRP is set out in the appendices as follows:

- Appendix 1: List of information and evidence that was included in the Information Pack for IRP Members
- Appendix 2: Elected Members and appointees who met with the IRP
- Appendix 3: Officers who provided a factual briefing to the IRP
- Appendix 4: Summary of benchmarking of Trafford Council Members' Allowances against other Greater Manchester Councils

Key Messages – Allowances Scheme – a low paying scheme

14. The evidence shows that the Trafford Council Members' Allowances scheme is a low paying scheme both comparatively and in real terms. This is particularly in relation to the Basic Allowance. Benchmarking shows that the Trafford Basic Allowance is the lowest by far across all of the Greater Manchester councils.

The Changing roles of Members

15. The low Basic Allowance and the fact that it (and all SRAs) has not been fundamentally reviewed at all for 20 years is in a context whereby that the roles of Members have changed dramatically since then. Legislative changes have increased the demands on all Members but on leading Members in particular. The current allowances payable does not reflect the increased demands made on Members

Basic Allowance acting as a deterrent to becoming and remaining a Member

16. The IRP received anecdotal evidence that the current level of Basic Allowance (and some SRAs) was acting as a barrier to the recruitment of a wide range of candidates to stand for Council. In particular, the time required to be a Member (whether this was at the most senior level or at the backbench level) was not recompensed by the current level of allowances payable.
17. While the Basic Allowance and SRAs were never intended to reflect the 'market value' of the workload and responsibilities undertaken by Members, they are intended to go a large way to recognising that there is a substantial time commitment and complexity to being an elected Member that is largely unrecognised in their current remuneration.
18. This purpose is highlighted by the original policy underpinning the work of remuneration panels when considering the principles for establishing a Members Allowances Scheme¹:

The financial support for Councillors must also reinforce the culture of the modern council and address, as far as possible, any disincentives to serving in local politics. People do not enter public service to make their fortune. But neither should they pay a price for serving the public.

¹ Modern Local Government – In touch with the People: Cm 4014 July 1998, 3.54

19. Currently, the Trafford Council Members' Allowances scheme does not meet this core principle underpinning the purpose of establishing such schemes.

The Trafford model of remuneration

20. There are two unusual features of the Trafford model of remuneration. Firstly, there is a plethora of SRAs payable. This is the case in the number of SRAs payable and the spread of SRAs across all Members regardless of their political group. Secondly, Trafford is highly unusual in allowing a Member to be paid 50% of any second SRA they may be eligible for. Clearly, the main rationale for this situation is to compensate for a low Basic Allowance. However, comparatively the money spent on SRAs is above the normal range when compared to the money spent on the Basic Allowance. The IRP concluded that as such the scheme needed rebalancing.

Putting the Allowances scheme on a par with Greater Manchester peers

21. A strong view that came across in both the written and oral representation made to the IRP was that the allowances paid in Trafford Council should be broadly in line with that paid across the other Greater Manchester Council. The broad view expressed was it was inequitable that Trafford Council should generally pay lower allowances than that in their peer authorities.
22. There was a further minority view expressed that there should be a national scheme of allowances. However, this is beyond the remit of the IRP, local discretion is in place and the IRP must work within the required legislative framework. As a result of this local discretion it has led the IRP to make Trafford appropriate recommendations that have cognisance of the allowances paid across Greater Manchester but not wholly driven by them.

Function of this review – fundamental reform required

23. The IRP recognises that it is never a good time to recommend increases in Members' allowances and now is a particularly difficult time to do so. However, for all the reasons outlined above the IRP has concluded that the scheme is no longer fit for purpose and the role of the IRP goes beyond that of addressing any particular anomalies arising, its role is to fundamentally modernise the scheme and to ensure it reflects the demands made upon the Members of the Council.

Recommendation – Triangulating the Basic Allowance

24. The IRP has, in the interests of transparency and robustness, laid out its deliberations regarding the current (£7,061) Basic Allowance. It has done this not only to show the Council the IRP has been diligent in listening to Members views but has taken seriously its remit regarding public accountability, namely that the recommended Basic Allowance is set at a fair level, is comparable to peer councils and represents value for money while fulfilling its function as an enabler.
25. Consequently, the IRP has triangulated the Basic Allowance as follows:

- **Recalibrating the Basic Allowance**
- **Weighing up the view of Members and governance changes since the previous review**
- **Putting the current Basic Allowance in a comparative context**

Recalibrating the Basic Allowance

26. In arriving at recommendations the IRP is required to pay regard to the 2006 Statutory Guidance. In considering the Basic Allowance the 2006 Statutory Guidance (paragraph 67) states:

Having established what local councillors do, and the hours which are devoted to these tasks the local authorities will need to take a view on the rate at which, and the number of hours for which, councillors ought to be remunerated.

24. The Statutory Guidance (paragraphs 68-69) expands on the above statement by advising IRPs to consider the following three variables, namely
- Time required to fulfil the role of the ordinary Member
 - Recognising public service principle
 - The rate of remuneration

Time to fulfil duties for which the Basic Allowance is paid

25. The Basic Allowance is primarily a time-based payment (see 2006 Statutory Guidance paragraph 10). It is paid to compensate for workload, plus minor expenses. Obviously Members work in different ways and have varying commitments and the time spent on council duties varies. Yet, the Basic Allowance is a flat rate allowance that must be paid equally to all Members. So the time assessment is typically taken as the average time required carrying out all those duties for which the Basic Allowance is paid.
26. The most up to date information available on what is a reasonable time expectation for which the Basic Allowance is paid has been derived from the 2018 Councillors Census. In data supplied to the Chair of the IRP from the Local Government Association, it showed that Councillors in metropolitan councils who held "no positions" of responsibility put in on average 24 hours per week "on council business"². The LGA includes within "council business"
- Council/committee meetings
 - Working with community groups
 - Engaging with constituents, etc.
 - Other³

² Information based on National Census of Local Authority Councillors 2018 (LGA), breakdown of mean weekly hours put in on council business by councillors by number of positions held and type of council, in email from S. Richards, LGA 21 October 2019.

³ See LGA, National census of local authority councillors 2018, Chart 3, page 5

27. For the purposes of recalibrating the Basic Allowance in line with the 2006 Statutory Guidance the IRP has not adopted the reported mean figure as it is inflated by respondents who put a great deal more than what is strictly required to fulfil the roles associated with the Basic Allowance. In other words, the mean figure is inflated by those who have the capacity to put in more through choice rather than requirement. Moreover, the figure of 20 hours per week more closely reflects the feedback from Member interviews.
28. As such, the IRP has adopted a figure of 20 hours (or 2.5 days) per week as more appropriate for the purposes of recalibrating the Basic Allowance. The IRP has equated this to 130 days per year based on an eight hour working day as the expected time input from Members for their Basic Allowance.

Recognising the Voluntary Principle – A Public Service Discount (PSD)

29. The 2006 Statutory Guidance (paragraph 67) says that it is necessary to establish out of the time required to do the work of the ordinary Member how many of those hours “ought to be remunerated.” What is meant by this is explained further in the Statutory Guidance (paragraph 68) which goes on to state

It is important that some element of the work of [elected] members continues to be voluntary – that some hours are not remunerated.

30. The element of unremunerated time often known as the ‘Public Service Discount’ (PSD) recognises the principle of public service. Thus, the voluntary principle is realised by discounting an element of the expected time inputs associated with the Basic Allowance. The typical range for this public service discount is between 30% - 40%, largely on the basis that is broadly in line with the proportion of time backbenchers spend on

- Dealing with constituents
- Attending surgeries
- General enquiries from citizens and
- Other constituent/ward related activities.

31. The IRP has opted for voluntary discount of 35% as it is the mid-point between the typical ranges of 30-40 per cent that most IRPs utilise as the size of the voluntary discount. It is also the most common size of voluntary discount used by IRPs in principal councils.
32. Thus, by applying a voluntary discount of 35% to the expected time input of 130 days per year it produces a voluntary element of 45.5 days per year. These are the hours that are ‘not remunerated’, deemed to be public service, leaving 84.5 remunerated days per year.

The rate for remuneration

33. Historically, in settling on the appropriate rate of remuneration to utilise in arriving at the recommended Basic Allowance IRPs primarily relied upon an advisory day

rate published by the LGA each year to assist IRPs in setting a rate of remuneration, which by 2010 had reached £152.77 per day.⁴

34. However, the LGA has since stopped issuing this advice as IRPs switched to a more locally based rate of remuneration as it more closely reflects the typical earnings of elected Members' constituents. A reason for the switch was one of data availability: the Office of National Statistics started to collect and publish data on average earnings on a council by council basis about 12 years ago in its Annual Survey of Hours & Earnings (ASHE). A second reason for the switch is that by using a rate of remuneration that is based on average earnings of Members constituents it has robustness and is readily defensible.
35. In 2022, the median daily salary (excluding overtime) for all full time employee jobs within the area of the Trafford Council was £119.24 as published by the Office of National Statistics (ONS).⁵ Thus, for the purposes of recalibrating the Basic Allowance the IRP has adopted a rate for remuneration at £119.24 per day.
36. If the IRP updated the variables to arrive at a recalibrated Basic Allowance to take into account the most recent data available it gives the following values:
- Time required for backbencher: 130 days per year (2.5 days per week)
 - Public Service Discount: 35% (45.5 days)
 - Rate for Remuneration: £119.24 per day
37. By following the methodology as set out in the 2006 Statutory Guidance with the most recent data available regarding the relevant updated variables it produces the following recalibrated Basic Allowance:
- 130 days per year input minus 35% PSD (45.5 days)
= 84.5 remunerated days per year multiplied by £119.24 per day
= £10,076

Representation received by the IRP

38. The second 'corner' of the triangulation process was the representation received from elected Members. There was a near unanimous view that the Basic Allowance was in need of revision, particularly to place it on a par with peers across Greater Manchester. It was pointed out that the Basic Allowance had not substantially altered in the past 20 years (subject to periodic indexation) and no longer reflected the demands placed on Members. Since the Basic Allowance was originally set the demands on Members have increased through such developments as gaining powers over local liquor licensing, greater working with local communities and the expectation to engage in local leadership and the demands placed on Members through the rise of social and other electronic media, which means that that are permanently on call.

⁴ See LGA alert 62/10, Members' Allowances, 23 June 2010

⁵ See ASHE, 2022, Table 7.2a - Median weekly pay – excluding overtime - for full time employee jobs in area of Trafford Council, which is £596.20 and divided by 5 working days equals £119.24 per day, <https://www.ons.gov.uk/employmentandlabourmarket/peopleinwork/earningsandworkinghours/datasets/placeofworkbylocalauthorityashtable7>

Benchmarking

39. Finally, the third ‘corner’ of the triangulation process was to benchmark the current Basic Allowance against other Greater Manchester metropolitan councils. Indeed, a key theme emerging from Member representation was that the Trafford Basic Allowance (and SRAs) should reflect the average paid across Greater Manchester.
40. Benchmarking⁶ shows that the current Trafford Council Basic Allowance is significantly below the average paid in peer Councils across Greater Manchester:

• Benchmarking group mean Basic Allowance	£12,102
• Benchmarking group median Basic Allowance	£11,408
• Trafford Council 2022/23 Basic Allowance	£7,061

Recommending the recalibrated Basic Allowance

41. By undertaking this triangulation process it produced the following potential values for the Basic Allowance

• Recalibrated Basic Allowance	£10,076
• Benchmarking group mean/median Basic Allowance	£12,102/£11,408
• Representation received	GM mean

42. In considering the recommended Basic Allowance, the IRP took on board the comment of one Member who said to the IRP “that the Basic Allowance should at least keep us in touch with the GM councils.” Thus, this ruled out recommending the GM average Basic Allowance.

43. As such the IRP has opted for the recalibrated Basic Allowance as it at least keeps the Trafford Basic Allowance ‘in touch’ with peers but primarily because it is based on the methodology set out in the Statutory Guidance and establishes a direct link with the current median earnings of the constituents of elected Members. Furthermore, opting for a Basic Allowance slightly below the GM average it also goes some way to recognise that most meetings ordinary Members attend are in the evening, which will not be the case in most other GM Councils.

44. **The IRP recommends that the Basic Allowance is reset at £10,076, subject to any indexation that may apply 2023/27**

Special Responsibility Allowances - The Leader's SRA

45. Currently, the Leader receives an SRA of £28,246. It has been set in accordance with an approach as set out in the Statutory Guidance (paragraph 76) which states:

One way of calculating special responsibility allowances may be to take the agreed level of basic allowance and recommend a multiple of this allowance as

⁶ See Appendix Four BM1

- an appropriate special responsibility allowance for either the elected mayor or the leader.
46. This is known as the factor approach and is commonly deployed by IRPs in arriving at the recommended SRA for Leaders on the basis that it is easy to understand, simple, transparent. A factor from a range of 2.75 – 3.25 is the commonly utilised multiple of the Basic Allowances regardless of type of council (although it tends to be towards the lower end of the typical range of multiples in district councils and the higher end in London Boroughs). In Trafford, the Leader's SRA is a factor of 4 times the Basic Allowance. This is high due to the low Basic Allowance.
 47. The role of Leader has undergone significant change since the role was last reviewed and it is clear that it requires a full time commitment, and certainly precludes any meaningful paid employment in the normal sense. In addition, the role of Leader had grown in responsibility with the passage of The Localism Act 2011. This Act enhanced the powers of all Leaders by requiring all Councils operating the executive model of governance to adopt the strong Leader model. Consequently the Leader now has all executive powers vested in the post and is responsible for the discharge of all executive functions, although much is delegated through the appointment of a Cabinet. The Leader also holds a portfolio as well as currently being the Leader of the Labour Group.
 48. The other aspect of the Leader's role that continues to develop is at the sub-regional level, namely at the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA). Although the Leader's responsibilities at the GMCA are addressed below, the reality is that regardless of whether there was a GMCA, the Leader of Trafford Council would have a sub-regional and regional, and indeed national, dimension to their role. This was evident before the GMCA was set up in 2011 as the Leader became the key post in representing Trafford at relevant forums regionally and nationally, such as the Association of Greater Manchester Authorities (AGMA) and the Local Government Association (LGA) – roles the Leader continues to carry out.
 49. In the main, the representation received by the IRP had no comment on the Leader's SRA, but where there was a view expressed it was that the current SRA was too low and needed to be increased and to be at least on a par with the average SRA paid to Leaders of GM Councils.
 50. Benchmarking shows that the SRA for the Trafford Council Leader is low, with mean GM Councils Leaders/elected Mayors' SRA being £37,695 and a median SRA of £32,945. In fact, the SRA for Leader of Trafford Council is the lowest across all the GM Councils; however this situation changes once the Leader's GMCA SRA is taken into account. Even then the total package received by the Leader is second from lowest amongst the GM councils.
 51. The IRP concluded that the Leader did merit a small increase in their SRA and decided to maintain the factor approach. In arriving at an appropriate multiple of the recommended Basic Allowance the IRP noted that benchmarking shows that across the GM councils the average SRA for GM Leaders/elected Mayor is 3.1 times the mean Basic Allowance. The IRP concluded that in light of the increase in the recommended Basic Allowance that that the GM mean multiple (3.1) was now more appropriate in arriving at the recommended SRA for the Leader, which equates to £31,236.

52. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Leader is reset at £31,236, subject to any indexation that may apply for 2023/27.⁷**

The Deputy Leader of the Council (x1)

53. In the main the rest of the SRAs paid in Trafford have been set in accordance with the approach laid out in the 2006 Statutory Guidance (paragraph 76) which states:

A good starting point in determining special responsibility allowances may be to agree the allowance which should be attached to the most time consuming post on the Council (this maybe the elected mayor or the leader) and pro rata downwards for the other roles which it has agreed ought to receive an extra allowance.

54. This is known as the 'pro rata' approach in that the other remunerated posts are assessed as a ratio or percentage of the Leader's role or their respective Chair's role. By definition the size of the Leader's roles is 100% and other SRAs are set as a proportion of 100%. Again it has the advantage of being simple, transparent and easy to understand. The IRP has chosen to maintain this approach and adjusted the current ratio for SRAs where there is a demonstrable case to do so.
55. The Deputy Leader, current SRA £19,770) which has been set at 70% of the Leader's SRA, also has a portfolio. The Deputy Leader undertakes the traditional role of attending briefings with the Leader, acting as a sounding board and stepping in for the Leader in the Leader's absence, which occurs more frequently as the Leader has had to undertake a larger GM wide role. Indeed it means that the Deputy Leader (as do most other executive members but to a lesser extent) can have a larger GM wide role. The Deputy Leader will also have a national role through usually being one of the Council's appointees (alongside the Leader and Leader of the Main Opposition Group) onto the Local Government Association (LGA) General Assembly.
56. Benchmarking shows that the SRA (£19,770) for the Trafford Deputy Leader is broadly on par with Deputy Leaders/Mayors across Greater Manchester, with a mean SRA of £21,139 and median SRA of £19,773 being paid to Deputy Leaders/Mayors across the GM Councils. In terms of methodology, the mean GM Deputy Leaders/Mayors SRA is 56% of the mean GM Leaders/elected Mayors' SRA, which is somewhat less than the current ratio of 70% deployed in Trafford Council.
57. Although in the main there was limited representation received regarding the role of other post holders (as being less visible than that of the Leader) insofar there was representation received regarding the SRA for the Deputy Leader the view expressed was that it should be on a par with that paid across the GM Councils. As such, the current ratio (70% of the Leader's SRA) has been reset at 65% of the Leader's recommended SRA to arrive at the recommended SRA for the Deputy Leader which equates to £20,303, which is approximately midpoint between the mean and median SRA paid to equivalent posts across Greater Manchester.

⁷ All recommendations relate to 2023/24 and are subject to any indexation that may be applicable for 2023/27

58. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Deputy Leader is reset at 65% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £20,303.**

Other Executive Members (x8)

59. Currently, the Leader appoints eight other Cabinet Members (Portfolio Holders), who each receive an SRA of £14,122, which is 50% per cent of the Leader's SRA. The IRP did receive some representation that questioned the need for eight other Cabinet Members. It is beyond the remit of the IRP to comment on how the Council decides to organise itself. However, the IRP does note that the Local Government Act 2000 places a legal maximum of 10 Executive Members (including Leader and Deputy Leader) so the limit has been reached.
60. The only other (albeit limited) representation the IRP received regarding the SRAs of the other Executive Members was that it should be on a par with that of other Executive Members across the GM Councils. Benchmarking shows that the current SRA paid to other Executive Members in Trafford Council, is somewhat below the average paid across the GM councils. The mean SRA paid to other Executive Members across the GM Councils is £16,187 (43% of the Leaders/elected Mayor mean SRA), with a median figure of £16,004.
61. The IRP received no evidence to revise the current ratio of 50% of the Leader's recommended SRA in arriving at the recommended SRA for the other Cabinet Members, which equates to £15,618, which is still below the mean and median SRA paid to equivalent posts across Greater Manchester.
62. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the eight other Executive Members of the Cabinet is £15,618, which has been set at 50% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236).**

Discontinuing the SRA for the Deputy Executive Members

63. Currently, the allowances scheme contains provision for an SRA of £7,060 for Deputy Executive Members, which has been set at 50% of the other Executive Members SRA, However, these posts are no longer appointed and therefore the SRA is redundant. The provision for an SRA for Deputy Executive Members should be struck from the Members' Allowances scheme.
64. **The IRP recommends that the provision for an SRA (£7,060) for Deputy Executive Members is discontinued.**

Lead Member for Education (x1) – extending the SRA

65. Currently the Leader appoints a Lead Member for Education, who is paid an SRA of £8,473, which has been set at 30% of the Leader's SRA. This is an unusual SRA and the only equivalent role the IRP could find across the GM councils is the City Centre Spokesperson at Manchester City Council who is paid an SRA of £7,913,

although this is in a context where Manchester also pays Deputy Executive Members.

66. The role of Lead Member for Education was established in response to a specific set of circumstances at the time when it was felt that the Council needed to provide a greater focus on education related issues. It can be seen as akin to a Deputy Executive role, the post holder while having a service lead has no executive responsibility and works at the direction of the Leader.
67. The IRP was informed that the role of Education Lead Member may be discontinued from the date of the 2023 Annual Meeting. Nonetheless, the IRP was informed that in the future other Lead Members may be appointed to reflect corporate priorities and where a dedicated support Member may be deemed necessary. Thus to future proof the scheme and in the absence of Deputy Executive Members the IRP has decided to maintain and extend this SRA.
68. In extending this SRA the IRP decided that as there is no cap on the number of Lead Members the Leader may appoint that a cap should be set on the number payable at any one time. The IRP settled on a cap of no more than four Lead Members being paid the Lead Member SRA at any one time, which is half of the number of other Executive Members.
69. In setting an appropriate SRA the IRP concluded that the best comparator was the other Executive Member roles, as such it has reset the SRA for Lead Members at 50% of the recommended SRA for other Executive Members, which equates to £7,809.
70. **The IRP recommends that the Lead Member SRA is maintained and extended to enable no more than four Lead Members to receive this SRA at any one time. The IRP also recommends that the Lead Member SRA is reset at 50% of the recommended SRA for other Executive Members (£15,618), and is paid at £7,809.**

Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee

71. Currently, the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee receives an SRA of £11,298, which has been set at 40% of the Leader's SRA. This (along with the Chair of Licensing) is the highest paid Chair in the Council. The IRP concluded that this was only correct as it meets monthly, more than any other Committee. The remit of the Planning & Development Management Committee is exercise powers in relation to planning and development management over development proposals in the Borough and in relation to functions specified in schedule 1 to the Local Authorities (Functions and Responsibilities) (England) Regulations 2000 which relate mainly to town and country planning, protection and registration of common land and regulation of the use of highways.
72. Again, the only (limited) representation received by the IRP for this SRA was that it should be in line with the SRA paid to Planning Chairs across Greater Manchester. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to GM councils Planning Chairs is £10,029, with a median SRA of £9,979, with a mean ratio of 27% of the mean SRA for Leaders/elected Mayor of GM councils. Clearly, the SRA for the Trafford

Planning & Development Management Committee Chair is above that paid to peers and set at a higher ratio than typically utilised by peers.

73. Nonetheless, the IRP has taken on board the workload of the Planning & Development Management Committee but has decided that the Chair's SRA should be closer to the mean/median SRA paid to similar posts across the GM councils. As such, the IRP has reset the SRA for the Chair of Planning & Development Management Committee at 35% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), which equates to £10,933. This is still somewhat above the mean and median SRA paid to Planning Chairs across the GM councils.
74. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee is reset at 35% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £10,933.**

Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee

75. Currently the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee is paid an SRA of £4,236 which equates to 37.5% of their Chair's current SRA. The role of Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee is to stand in when required, which is not particularly often and be prepared to stand in. While no Vice Chair is required to attend pre-meetings (where agendas are gone through and agreed) the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee does so in the majority of cases.
76. Again, the only representation received regarding this SRA was that it should be on a par with the SRA paid to Vice Chair of Planning Committee across Greater Manchester. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to Vice Chairs of Planning Committees across Greater Manchester to be £3,488 with a median SRA of £3,387, although not all of the GM councils pay a SRA to their Vice Chair of Planning, six out of ten councils. In fact, the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee in Trafford is the highest across Greater Manchester.
77. Moreover, the IRP received no evidence that the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee exercised 37.5% of the workload and responsibility of their Chair. In this case the IRP decided to be guided by the benchmarking and has reset the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee at 30% of the recommended SRA (£10,933) which equates to £3,280.
78. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee is reset at 30% of their Chair's recommended SRA (£10,933), and is paid at £3,280.**

Chair of the Licensing Committee

79. Currently, the Chair of the Licensing Committee is paid on a par with the Chair of the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee with an SRA of £11,877. This has been set at 40% of the Leader's SRA.

80. The IRP queried why the SRA for the Chair of the Licensing Committee is paid on a par with the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee as the latter meets more frequently than the Licensing Committee, with the full committee meeting no more than once per year. Although the Licensing Committee exercises powers in relation to the Council's licensing functions under the Licensing Act (2003) and Gambling Act (2005) its main function in reality is to determine and maintain the Council's licensing policies.
81. However, most the work of the Licensing Committee is carried out through two sub-committees, the Licensing Sub-Committee which deals licensing applications under the Licensing Act (2003) and Gambling Act (2005) and the Public Protection Sub-Committee which deals with all other licensing, registration and regulatory functions, including taxi licensing. The Public Protection Sub-Committee has 11 scheduled meetings per year, although on average one or two are cancelled each year due to lack of business. In effect this is the main "Licensing Committee". The Licensing Sub-Committee meets as and when required, e.g., to deal with an objection to the operation of licensing premises or variation in licensing hours, but in 2021/22 there were 11 such meeting and at the time of the review there had been six meetings of the Licensing Sub-Committee.
82. The Public Protection Licensing Sub-Committee consists of nine members while the Licensing Sub-Committee consists of three members, all drawn from the parent committee. More importantly the Chair of the two Licensing Sub-Committees is expected to be in the first instance the Chair of the full Licensing Committee. In practice the Chair of the Licensing Committee has chaired the Licensing Sub-Committees in most instances.
83. As such the IRP notes that the Chair of the Licensing Committee is chairing a similar number of meetings as the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee.
84. Again the only representation received regarding this SRA is that it should be paid on a par with the SRA paid to Chairs of Licensing Committees across the GM councils. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to GM Chairs of Licensing Committees is £9,411 with a median SRA of £9,135 but the other GM Licensing Chairs do not necessarily have the same role in their respective Licensing Sub-Committee[s] as in Trafford. Nonetheless, the IRP received no evidence that the Chair of Licensing Committee should not continue to be paid an SRA on a par with the recommended SRA (£10,933) for the Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee.
85. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chair of the Licensing Committee is reset at 35% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £10,933.**

Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee

86. Currently the Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee is paid a SRA of £4,236 which equates to 37.5% of their Chair's current SRA. The Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee is expected to undertake the normal Vice Chair roles although the Vice

Chair does not attend pre-meetings with their Chair and relevant Officer. However, the Council Constitution states that the Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee is the second nominated person to chair the Licensing Sub-Committees if the Chair is unable to do so. As such, their SRA is merited.

87. Again the only representation received regarding this SRA was that the post holder should be paid on a par with the SRA paid to Vice Chairs of Licensing Committees across the GM councils. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to GM council Licensing Committee Vice Chairs is £3,378 and median SRA is £3,507. Again, the Vice Chair of Licensing in Trafford is the highest paid across the GM council. However, it is noted that Licensing Vice Chairs in the other GM councils doesn't always have such an active role in their licensing sub-committees as is the case in Trafford.
88. Consequently, bearing in mind the role of the Chair of the Licensing Committee in the Licensing Sub-Committees the IRP has concluded that it is appropriate to maintain their SRA on a par with the recommended SRA for the Vice Chair of the Planning & Development Management Committee, which is £3,280.
89. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee is reset at 30% of their Chair's recommended SRA (£10,933), and is paid at £3,280.**

Discontinuation of SRA for the Licensing Sub-Committees

90. Currently the scheme contains provision for an SRA to be paid pro rata to the Chairs of the Licensing Sub-Committees. It is paid at £3,591 (pro rata depending on number of Sub-Committees chaired), which is the equivalent of 32.5% of the Chair's SRA. Benchmarking shows that this is paid in only three out of the ten GM councils so benchmarking is of limited value in this case.
91. Moreover, this SRA is largely redundant as the Chair and Vice Chair of Licensing chair the vast majority of Licensing Sub-Committees which is recognised in their recommended SRA. There is an odd occasion when some other Member of the Licensing Committee is required to chair the Licensing Sub-Committees but it is so infrequent as not to meet the test of 'significant responsibility' for an SRA to be payable.
92. **The IRP recommends that the provision for SRAs for the Chairs of the Licensing Sub-Committees is discontinued.**

Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees (X3)

93. Currently the Council has three Scrutiny Committees as follows:
 - The Children & Young People's Scrutiny Committee
 - The Scrutiny Committee
 - The Health Scrutiny Committee

94. These are statutory committees and are the means by which the Executive is held to account and also feed into the Executive and Council in proposing policy and monitoring performance. They are scheduled to meet at least five times per year. They can and do set up Task & Finish Working Groups that meet at least 2-3 times each to delve into a particular issue in more depth and feedback their findings to the parent Scrutiny Committee. The Scrutiny Committees have no decision making powers.
95. Currently, each of the three Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees receive an SRA of £8,473, which has been set at 30% of the Leader's current SRA. Again, the only representation received regarding these SRAs was that they should be on a par with the SRAs paid to Scrutiny Chairs across Greater Manchester. Benchmarking shows that the Chairs of Scrutiny Committee in the GM councils are paid a mean SRA of £8,581 and median SRA of £8,426, although in some of the larger GM councils there are more Scrutiny Committees in place.
96. The IRP received no evidence that the current SRA paid to the Scrutiny Chairs is not broadly appropriate and has concluded that their SRAs should be on similar to the mean SRA paid to equivalent Chairs across Greater Manchester. As such, the IRP has reset the SRA for the Chairs of the Scrutiny at 27.5% of the recommended SRA (£31,236), which equates to £8,580.
97. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chairs of the three Scrutiny Committees is reset at 27.5% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £8,590.**

Vice Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees (X3)

98. Currently, the three Vice Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees are paid an SRA of £4,236, which has been set at 50% of the current SRA paid to the Scrutiny Chairs. The Scrutiny Vice Chairs do not have any specified discrete tasks to undertake, for instance they are not expected to chair any relevant Scrutiny Task and Finish Group and their role is limited to standing in when required which occurs rarely, nor do they all attend the relevant pre-meetings.
99. Again the only (very limited) representation received regarding these SRAs was that they should be in line with that paid to Scrutiny Vice Chairs across the GM councils. However, benchmarking is of very limited value in this case as only three out of the ten GM council pay such a post but it is noted that the Vice Chairs of Scrutiny in Trafford are paid the highest in the three GM councils that pay such a post.
100. The IRP received no evidence that the SRA for the Scrutiny Vice Chairs should be on a par with that paid to the Vice Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees. Methodologically and logically it is inconsistent. As such, the IRP has concluded that the SRA for the Vice Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees should be reset at the same ratio it applied to the Vice Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees and reset them at 30% of the recommended SRA (£8,580) for the Chairs of Scrutiny, which equates to £2,577.

101. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Vice Chairs of the three Scrutiny Committees is reset at 30% of the Scrutiny Chairs' recommended SRA (£8,590), and is paid at £2,577.**

Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee (X1)

102. Currently, the Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee receives an SRA of £8,473, which has been set at 30% of the Leader's current SRA. While there is no statutory requirement to have an Audit Committee it is a statutory function and is now regarded as good practice to have such a committee. The purpose of the Accounts & Audit Committee is to provide independent assurance of the adequacy of the risk management framework and the associated control environment, independent scrutiny of the Authority's financial and non-financial performance to the extent that it affects the Council's exposure to risk and weakens the control environment, and to oversee the financial reporting process as well as corporate governance. It is scheduled to meet five times per year.
103. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to Chairs of equivalent committees across the GM is £8,161 with a median SRA of 8,379, although three of the GM councils do not have a separate Audit Committee.
104. The IRP received no evidence that the Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee should not continue to be paid an SRA that is on par with the recommended SRA for the Scrutiny Chairs, which has been reset at 27.5% of the recommended SRA (£31,236) for the Leader.
105. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee is reset at 27.5% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £8,590.**

Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee (X1)

106. Currently, the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee is paid an SRA of £4,236, which has been set at 50% of the current SRA paid to the Accounts & Audit Chair. The role of the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee is limited to being prepared and standing in when required, which rarely occurs. Nor does the post holder attend all the relevant pre-meetings.
107. Again the only (very limited) representation received regarding these SRAs was that they should be in line with that paid to Audit Vice Chairs across the GM councils. However, benchmarking is of very limited value in this case as only three out of the ten GM council pay such a post but it is noted that the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee in Trafford is paid the highest SRA in the three GM councils that pay such a post.
108. The IRP received no evidence that the SRA for the Accounts & Audit Vice Chair should be on a par with that paid to the Vice Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees. Methodologically and logically it is inconsistent. As such, the IRP has concluded that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee should be reset at the same ratio it applied to the Vice

Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees and reset them at 30% of the recommended SRA (£8,590) for the Chair of Accounts & Audit, which equates to £2,577.

109. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee is reset at 30% of the Account & Audit Chairs recommended SRA (£8,590), and is paid at £2,577.**

Chair of the Employment Committee (X1)

110. Currently, the Chair of the Employment Committee receives an SRA of £8,473, which has been set at 30% of the Leader's current SRA. The role of the Employment Committee is to determine and keep under review collective and corporate terms and conditions of employment, for approving human resources policies, the establishment of Services of the Council and matters relating to employment. It is scheduled to meet quarterly although extraordinary meetings can be scheduled as required.
111. Again the only (very limited) representation received regarding this SRA was that it should be in line with that paid to Employment Chairs across the GM councils. However, benchmarking is of very limited value in this case as only two out of the ten GM council pay such a post largely because not all GM councils have a standing Employment Committee.
112. Nonetheless, Employment matters has been deemed significant enough by the Council that it merits a standing committee and as such the Chair merits an SRA. However, the IRP concluded that the workload and responsibility of the Chair of the Employment Committee is not on a par with the Chairs of the Scrutiny and Accounts and Audit Committees and has decided to reset the SRA for the Chair of Employment Committee at 25% of the recommended SRA (£31,236) for the Leader, which equates to £7,809.
113. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chair of the Employment Committee is reset at 25% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £7,809.**

Vice Chair of the Employment Committee (X1)

114. Currently, the Vice Chair of the Employment Committee is paid an SRA of £4,236, which has been set at 50% of the current SRA paid to the Employment Chair. The role of the Vice Chair of the Employment Committee is limited to being prepared and standing in when required, which rarely occurs. Nor does the post holder attend all the relevant pre-meetings.
115. Again the only (very limited) representation received regarding these SRAs was that they should be in line with that paid to Audit Vice Chairs across the GM councils. However, benchmarking cannot be done in this instance as Trafford is the only one of the GM councils that remunerated their Vice Chair of the Employment Committee. As a result, the IRP deliberated on whether this post should continue

to be paid an SRA but as it is practice to remunerate the Vice Chairs of all the major standing committees the IRP decided to maintain it.

116. However, the IRP received no evidence that the SRA for the Employment Vice Chair should be on a par with that paid to the Vice Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees. Methodologically and logically it is inconsistent. As such, the IRP has concluded that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Employment Committee should be reset at the same ratio it applied to the other Vice Chairs, which is 30% of the recommended SRA (£7,809) for the Chair of Employment, which equates to £2,577.
117. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Vice Chair of the Accounts & Audit Committee is reset at 30% of the Account & Audit Chairs recommended SRA (£8,590), and is paid at £2,343.**

Chair of the Standards Committee (X1)

118. Currently the Chair of the Standards Committee receives an SRA of £2,496, which equates to just under 9% of the Leader's current SRA. The main roles of the Standards Committee is to promote and maintain high standards of conduct, to make recommendations to the Council on the council's Code of Conduct and grant dispensations. It is scheduled to meet three times per year but these meetings are regularly cancelled due to lack of business. However, the Standards Committee also has a role to determine by way of its Hearing Panel whether a Member has breached the Code of Conduct and if so whether to take action and what action to take. The Chair of the Standards Committee is expected to lead in any Hearings Panels that are held, which historically have been very few in number.
119. The IRP considered whether to continue this SRA but as Standards has been deemed significant enough by the Council that it merits a standing committee and as such the Chair merits an SRA. Moreover, just because there have rarely been Standards Hearings Panels in the past it does not preclude them occurring in the future. Maintaining an SRA for the Chair of Standards is as much for the potential as actual role as it has historically transpired.
120. Benchmarking is of limited value in this case as only three out of the ten GM councils remunerate such a Chair of Standards. Consequently, the IRP concluded, due to the limited number of Standards meetings that the SRA for the Chair of the Standards Committee should be reset at 7.5% of the recommended SRA (£31,236) for the Leader, which equates to £2,343.
121. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Chair of the Standards Committee is reset at 7.5% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £2,343.**

Discontinuation of SRA for Social Service Visits

122. Currently the allowances scheme contains provision for Members who undertake Social Services visits an SRA of £664. Among the ten GM councils this SRA is unique to Trafford. Moreover, it is never claimed so therefore is redundant.

123. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for Social Service Visits is discontinued.**

Comments on Opposition SRAs – a plethora are paid

124. What is unique in the Trafford Members' Allowances scheme is that there is provision for SRAs for all Opposition roles (where appointed) that mirror the positions of responsibility in the controlling group. This, as far as can be discerned, only occurs in Trafford. Moreover, the logic of SRAs is that they are paid for positions of "significant additional responsibility" (see 2006 Statutory Guidance paragraph 70). It is recognised the plethora of Opposition SRAs is partly a function of having such a low Basic Allowance it enables a wide as range of Members as possible to have a compensating SRA. As the IRP has recommended an increased SRA this logic is no longer applicable.

Leader of Main Opposition Group (X1)

125. The 2003 Regulations require that where the Council is controlled by one or more political groups (defined as having a minimum of two Members) then at least one SRA must be paid to an Opposition Member. The current Trafford Council allowances scheme fulfils this requirement and more. Nonetheless, it is typical to remunerate the Leaders of the Main Opposition Groups at least.

126. The scheme specifies that the SRA for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group should only be paid where the Main Opposition Group has 25% of seats on the Council. Again this is highly unusual; the Leader of the Main Opposition Group has a primary responsibility to lead the Opposition and provides critical challenge to the controlling group. Moreover, the Leader of the Main Opposition Group will also be consulted by the Chief Executive when required. There is a significant role to undertake regardless of group size.

127. **Consequently, the IRP recommends that the current threshold of the Leader of the Main Opposition Group representing at least 25% the Council membership before the SRA is paid is removed.**

128. The current SRA (£14,122) for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group has been set at 50% of the Leader's current SRA and on a par with the current SRA for the other Executive Members. Benchmarking shows that the mean SRA paid to Leaders of Main Opposition Groups across the GM councils is £11,129, with a median SRA of £11,207, with a mean ratio of 30%. The SRA for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group is the second highest across the GM councils.

129. Moreover, no other GM council pays an SRA to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group that is the equivalent to the SRA paid to other Executive Members. The one exception is Bolton, which perversely pays a higher SRA to the Leader of its Main Opposition Group than to its other Executive Members. However, it is noted that this anomaly is a result of a piecemeal review of allowances with the SRAs for other Executive Members being reviewed in isolation a number of years ago. It is further noted that Bolton is currently undertaking a full review of its allowances scheme.

130. Nonetheless, the IRP notes that there is an important constitutional distinction between the role of other Executive Members and the Leader of the Main Opposition Group, the latter has no executive decision making powers. While the Leader of the Main Opposition Group may have a similar workload to other Executive Members by definition the Leader of the Main Opposition Group does not have similar levels of responsibility.
131. As such, the IRP has decided to reset the SRA for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group and concluded that it should be more in line with the SRA paid to Main Opposition Group Leaders across the GM councils. Therefore it is appropriate to reset the SRA on a par with the recommended SRA (£10,933) for the Chairs of Planning & Development and Licensing Committees, which is 35% of the recommended SRA for the Leader.
132. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group is reset at 35% of the Leader's recommended SRA (£31,236), and is paid at £10,933.**

Deputy Leader of Main Opposition Group (X1)

133. Currently the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group receives an SRA of £2,823, which has been set at 20% of the current SRA for Main Opposition Group Leader. Benchmarking shows that the role of Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group is paid an SRA in six out of the ten GM councils, with a mean SRA of £4,854 and median SRA of £4,752.
134. In considering the appropriate SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group the IRP has not been guided by the average SRA paid to equivalent posts across the GM councils as they are not consistently remunerated and the IRP is also recommending that Shadow Executive Members continue to receive an SRA (see below) thus ensuring that the Main Opposition Group is adequately resourced. Nonetheless, the IRP has decided to reset the ratio utilised to arrive at the SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition by applying an uplift from 20% to 30% of the recommended SRA (£10,933) for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group, which equates to £3,280, which places it on a par with the recommended SRA for the Vice Chairs of the Planning & Development Management and Licensing Committees.
135. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group is reset at 30% of the recommended SRA (£10,933), and is paid at £3,280.**
136. Currently, the SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group is only payable if the Main Opposition Group reaches 25% of the Council membership. This threshold is not unknown for this post. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the Deputy Leader of the Main Opposition Group is only payable if the Main Opposition Group has at least 25% of Council membership.**

Shadow Executive Members (X8)

137. Currently the allowances scheme contains provision for an SRA payable to Shadow Executive Members (which must reflect the composition of the Council's other Executive Members). The SRA payable is currently £2,823, which has been set at 20% of the current SRA paid to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group.
138. Benchmarking shows that the equivalent roles are only paid in one other GM council so meaningful comparisons cannot be drawn. It does suggest that there is not a strong case to maintain these SRAs however the IRP has decided to maintain the SRAs for the Shadow Executive Members on the grounds of ensuring that the Main Opposition is adequately resourced, even if it is above the normal level of resourcing that is typical elsewhere.
139. In arriving at the appropriate SRA for the Shadow Executive Members the IRP received no representation or evidence that the current ratio of 20% of the SRA for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group Leader is not still apt – 20% of the recommended SRA (£10,933) for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group equates to £2,187.
140. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the other Shadow Executive Members is set at 20% of the recommended SRA (£10,933) for the Leader of the Main Opposition Group, and is paid at £2,187.**
141. Currently, the SRA for the other Shadow Executive Members is only payable if the Main Opposition Group reaches 25% of the Council membership. The IRP received no representation or evidence not to maintain this threshold. **The IRP recommends that the SRA for the other Shadow Executive Members Group is only payable if the Main Opposition Group has at least 25% of Council membership.**

Discontinuation of SRA for Shadow Deputy Executive Members

142. Currently the scheme contains provision for an SRA for Shadow Deputy Executive Members of £1,410 which is 10% of the current SRA paid to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group. The IRP notes that Trafford is the only GM council that has such a provision in its allowances scheme. However, as there are no Deputy Executive Members appointed then no Shadow Deputy Executive Members are appointed. Even if they were appointed the IRP can see no reason for an SRA to be payable – no other GM council pays such an SRA and the recommended increase in the Basic Allowance undermines the logic of such an SRA.
143. **The IRP recommends that the current provision in the Members' Allowances scheme to pay an SRA of £1,410 to Shadow Deputy Executive Members is discontinued.**

Discontinuation of SRA for Shadow Lead Member for Education

144. Currently the scheme contains provision for an SRA for the Shadow Lead Member for Education of £1,729, which is the equivalent of just over 12% of the current SRA paid to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group. Again among the GM councils this is a SRA that is unique to Trafford. Also, the logic of such an SRA is much reduced with the recommended increase in the Basic Allowance and the

comparatively well-resourced Main Opposition Group based on the IRPs current recommendations.

145. **The IRP recommends that the current provision in the Members' Allowances scheme to pay an SRA of £1,729 to Shadow Lead Member for Education is discontinued.**

Discontinuation of SRA for Opposition Spokespersons (Planning & Development Management and Licensing)

146. Currently the scheme contains provision for an SRA for the Opposition Spokespersons for Planning & Development Management and Licensing of £2,823, which Shadow Lead Member for Education of £1,729, which is the equivalent of 20% of the current SRA paid to the Leader of the Main Opposition Group. Again among the GM councils these SRAs are unique to Trafford. Similarly, the logic of such SRAs is much reduced with the recommended increase in the Basic Allowance and the comparatively well-resourced Main Opposition Group based on the IRPs current recommendations.

147. **The IRP recommends that the current provision in the Members' Allowances scheme to pay an SRA of £2,823 to the Opposition Spokespersons for Planning and Development Management and Licensing is discontinued.**

Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups (X2)

148. Currently the Leaders of the two Minority Opposition Groups (Liberal Democrat and the Greens) are paid an SRA of £2,823 which has been set at 10% to the Leader's current SRA. While the Leaders of the Minority Opposition Groups do not have the same pressures to provide the primary challenge to the controlling group they do have an Opposition role nonetheless and are called upon when required to join the Leader and Main Opposition Group Leader to present a united front for the Council as well being consulted on major issues.

149. Benchmarking shows these posts are normally paid in the GM councils, with nine out of ten GM councils paying an SRA to the Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups with a mean SRA of £4,059 and median SRA of £2,882.

150. The IRP received no evidence that a ratio of 10% of the Leader's SRA is no longer appropriate. By maintaining a ratio of 10% of the recommended SRA (£31,236) for the Leader to arrive at the recommended SRA for the Leaders of the Minority Opposition it arrives at a recommended SRA of £3,124.

151. **The IRP recommends that the Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups should be paid an SRA set at 10% of the recommended SRA (£31,236) for the Leader, which is £3,124.**

Setting a threshold for SRA for Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups

152. The 1989 Local Government Act allows a political group to be formed by only two Members. As the allowances scheme currently stands it would mean that if there

was a Minority Opposition Group of just two Members then the Group Leader would be paid the relevant SRA. The IRP felt that was inequitable, a group of two Members does not reach a critical mass. As such, the IRP has decided to set a qualifying threshold that a Minority Group must reach before their Group Leader is paid the Minority Opposition Group Leader's SRA. This is often done where such an SRA is payable.

153. In setting the qualifying threshold the IRP did not want to set the bar too high so as to effectively exclude all Leaders of Minority Opposition Groups yet it should be higher than the current legal minimum of two Members. As such, the IRP simply doubled the current legal minimum of two Members and set it at four Members.
154. **The IRP recommends that for the recommended SRA (£3,124) for a Leader of a Minority Opposition Group to be payable then that Minority Opposition Group must have at least four Group Members.**

Recommended SRAs in accordance with the GMCA Order 2011 - Trafford Council Leader appointed to the GMCA (X1)

155. Currently, the Leader is paid an SRA of £10,432 for being a Member of the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA) Board. The GMCA is prohibited from paying allowances to any of its Members or appointees to its committees. This point was made specifically in the 2015 amendment to the GMCA 2011 Order, and any remuneration in this regard has to be paid through the schemes of the constituent councils.
156. The rolling implementation of devolution has created a different set of challenges for all GM Council Leaders/elected Mayor and the Trafford Leader in particular. All GM Leaders/elected Mayor are full Members of the GMCA. Each Leader on the GMCA has a particular policy lead. At time of the review the Trafford Leader had not been in place long enough for a GMCA portfolio to be assigned. Regardless, by holding a GMCA portfolio it will involve appointments to other relevant bodies, such as being appointed to the AGMA relevant Committee and other GM-wide stakeholder bodies relevant to the particular portfolio.
157. The GM region is the only region thus far to take control of its combined health and social care budgets, which is more than £6 billion. More recently, through the GMCA Devolution Agreement with the Government, there has been a further significant devolution of powers and responsibilities to GMCA designed to drive economic growth and reform of public services. There was general agreement that the GMCA-related work of the Leader had increased significantly over the years and the GMCA SRA for the Leader was merited.
158. The IRP notes that currently five of the ten GM councils make separate SRA provision for their Leader on the GMCA. The fact that it is not paid in the five other GM councils is partly due to the fact that some of their respective IRPs have not had the opportunity to review the role recently rather than being a conscious decision. In the case of Manchester and Salford Councils the SRA for their Leader/elected Mayor has been set at a high level to reflect their work on the GMCA. However, the normal practice is to separately identify the Leaders GMCA SRA (where paid) in anticipation that in the future the GMCA will gain the authority

to pay such SRAs directly and the Councils that pay a separate GMCA Leader's SRA would then be able to discontinue it.

159. Although the benchmarking is limited, out of the five G councils that pay their Leader a GMCA SRA under the 2011 Order) it does show the following:

- Bury Leader's GMCA SRA: £6,000
- Oldham Leader's GMCA SRA: £6,089
- Rochdale Leaders GMCA SRA: £5,879
- Trafford Leader's GMCA SRA: £10,432
- Wigan Leader's GMCA SRA: £10,237

160. Although it is on very limited data, it produces a GMCA Leader's mean SRA of £7,727 and a median figure of £6,089. Clearly, the Trafford Leader's GMCA SRA is above the average paid to other GM council Leaders, in fact it is the highest. The IRP is at ease with this situation. Firstly, as other GM council IRPs get round to reviewing an SRA for the Leader appointed to the GMCA the average payable will inevitably increase. Moreover, it is noted that when the recommended Basic Allowance (£10,076), Leader's Trafford recommended SRA (£31,236) and current Leader's GMCA (£10,423) is aggregated to show the total remuneration it equates to £51,744. This is in line with the GM councils mean total remuneration package of £53,661 and median Leaders total remuneration package of £49,866.

161. The IRP is recommending that the Leader's GMCA SRA is maintained at £10,432, and is not subject to the 1 SRA only recommendations.

Recommended SRAs in accordance with the GMCA Order 2011 – Trafford Members appointed to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee (X1 + 1)

162. During the course of the review the Council received a report from the GMCA that also contained a report from the GMCA IRP setting out its recommendations regarding the payment of SRAs of GM council Members appointed to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee. All GM councils are required to appoint Members to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee and it is a statutory committee. Currently Trafford appoints one full Member and one substitute Member to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

163. The GMCA IRP reviewed these SRAs in anticipation of the enacting of the Levelling Up Bill which will give the GMCA the authority to remunerate GM council Members appointed to its Overview & Scrutiny Committee. However, the Levelling Up Bill is still proceedings through Parliament and therefore the GMCA does not yet have the legislative power to pay an SRA directly to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee Members. As an interim arrangement the GMCA is asking all GM councils to adopt the recommendations of the GMCA IRP regarding GM council Members appointed to its Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

164. In turn Trafford Council has asked the IRP to consider GMCA IRP recommendations regarding the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny SRAs to ensure that the requirements of the 2003 Regulations have been met both in spirit and to the letter.

165. The GMCA IRP recommended that the following SRAs should be paid to GM council Members appointed to its Overview & Scrutiny Committee:

- Full Member: annual SRA of £3,228
- Substitute Member: an annual standing SRA of £536 +
A variable SRA of £134.52 for each meeting attended of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee and related Task & Finish Groups
- Chair: an annual SRA of £9,684
- Vice Chair (if appointed): an annual SRA of £4,035

166. The IRP having considered the GMCA IRP report and recommendations concluded that there was no case to revise those recommendations. The IRP considered this to be more of a technical issue, the GMCA has agreed the SRAs to be paid and for legal reasons they can only be paid by the respective GM councils via their own allowances schemes until the relevant legislation is in place for the GMCA to pay them directly. Moreover, there will be no financial impact for Trafford Council as the payment of these SRAs will be reimbursed by the GMCA.

167. As such, the IRP recommends that the Council pays the following SRAs to the Members it appoints to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee (until the GMCA acquires powers to pay the posts itself) as follows:

- **The full Member (X1):** annual SRA of £3,228
- **The Substitute Member (X1):** an annual standing SRA of £536 + a variable SRA of £134.52 for each meeting attended of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee and related Task & Finish Groups
- **If a Trafford Member is Chair:** an annual SRA of £9,684
- **If a Trafford Member is Vice Chair (and GMCA appoints one):** an annual SRA of £4,035

SRAs considered but not recommended – Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee

168. The IRP did receive some representation that Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee should be paid a small SRA. The rationale behind this view was that Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee met attended more meetings than Members of other committees.

169. The IRP did not accept this argument. The Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee already receive an additional remuneration through the flat rate travel allowance. While this is paid to recognise travel costs associate with Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee carrying out personal site visits there is no compulsion to undertake such visits and therefore in some instances operates as a supplemental remuneration. Moreover, there is additional work other Members do or can potentially undertake for which they are not paid an SRA, for instance. Members working in more informal ways

such as in Task and Finish Groups. The Basic Allowance is intended to recognise all aspects of Members workloads. Finally it is noted that none of the other GM councils pay an SRA for to their Members of their Planning Committees.

- 170. The IRP does not recommend that the Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee are paid an SRA.**

Clarifying the SRA schedule

171. Currently, the SRA schedule as set out in the Members' Allowances scheme does not set out the SRA paid to each Committee Chair and Vice Chair of the Scrutiny, Accounts & Audit and Employment Committees, it simply sets out the SRA for "Committee Chairs" and "Committee Vice Chairs". This makes the scheme opaque to any interested parties who may be reading the scheme.
172. In the interests of transparency **the IRP recommends that the SRA paid to the Chairs and Vice Chairs of the Scrutiny, Accounts & Audit and Employment Committees are individually listed.**

Discontinuation of the 50% of second SRA payable – replace with 1 SRA only rule and exceptions

173. Currently, a Member who holds two remunerated post is able to receive 100% of the highest SRA and 50% of the other SRA for which they are eligible. The logic behind this provision is to partially compensate for the current low Basic Allowance, a logic that is no longer applicable with the recommended increase in the Basic Allowance. If the intent was to recompense for responsibility then the full second SRA would be paid.
174. The 2003 Regulations do not prohibit the number of SRAs a Council may pay or the number of SRAs a Member may be paid. However, it is an almost universal practice for Councils to have a 1 SRA only rule in that regardless of the number of remunerated posts a Member may hold. The rationale behind this rule is that it makes the scheme more transparent, anyone can understand the total remuneration received by a Member simply by reading the allowances scheme. It also potentially can lead to a situation where a Member is paid more than the Leader which is counter intuitive although it is noted that as 50% of a second SRA is payable in Trafford this is situation would not arise in reality.
175. Also, it is noted that Trafford is the only GM council that pays a Member a second SRA even if it is paid at 50%. Finally, in the representation received Members generally accepted that the second SRA payable at 50% was an anachronism if the Basic Allowance was increased.
- 176. The IRP recommends that the current practice of paying a second SRA to a Member at 50% is discontinued. In its place a clarification should be inserted into the Allowances scheme that states that no Member is able to be paid more than 1 SRA regardless of the number of remunerated posts they may hold with the exception of the additional SRAs paid under the 2011 GMCA Order.**

The Co-optees' Allowance

177. The 2000 Local Government Act permits Councils to appoint non-elected persons to be Members of their committees; normally they are appointed for having an independent perspective, such a co-opted Member of Standards or bring a particular expertise to a Committee, such as a co-opted Member on Audit who has particular financial knowledge and expertise. Co-opted Members do not have the right to vote.

178. Currently, the allowances scheme pays an annual Co-optees' Allowance as follows:⁸

- Co-optees on Standards Committee (5): £834
- Other Co-optees (6): £1,247

179. The Co-optees' Allowance is difficult to benchmark as not all Councils pay such an allowance. However, the levels payable in Trafford appear to be at the upper end of the comparative spectrum, with Stockport paying all Co-optees £322 per year, Salford paying all co-opted Members £427 per year with Manchester paying all their co-optees £993 and for those attend a Standards Hearing Panel £178 per meeting, with Wigan paying £1,255 per year to all Co-optees.

180. Nonetheless, the IRP received no evidence suggest the Co-optees' Allowances required revision. Therefore, **the IRP is recommending no change to the Co-optees' Allowances.**

The Dependants' Carers' Allowance (DCA)

181. The 2003 Regulations give specific authority for Members to claim an allowance for care of any dependants they may have while undertaking approved duties (that are defined by statute). It was specifically introduced to enable a wider range of Members to stand and be on Council. It is known as the Dependants' Carers' Allowance (DCA). The DCA is now also commonplace across all English Councils.

182. The Council has provision for a DCA in its allowances scheme that simply states that it is payable up to a maximum £89 per week regardless of the type of care required. It is only payable on the production of receipts and it cannot be claimed where the carer is part of a Member's household.

183. The IRP noted that the DCA is rarely if ever claimed. In fact a number of interviewees were not aware such an allowance was available. The IRP understands that there may be reluctance on the part of some eligible Members to claim the DCA as it appears as a published expense against a Members' name in the annual statutory publication of remuneration and reimbursements received by each Member. The IRP takes this opportunity to point out that this allowance was given recognition in statute and is specifically designed to reduce a potential barrier

⁸ It is noted that the 5 Co-optees allotted to the Children and Young People's Scrutiny Committee are currently vacant but the IRP has maintained the provision nonetheless.

to being an elected Member for those with caring responsibilities. The IRP suggests that if it is known that a Member has caring responsibilities then the DCA is specifically brought to their attention. It should be also pointed out that the approved duties for which this allowance may be claimed is governed by statute.

184. Regardless, the IRP received almost universal support in the representation received to maintain this allowance on the principle that it helped reduce a barrier to public service from traditionally underrepresented sections of the population. Moreover, all the GM Councils now make the DCA available.
185. The IRP supports the continuation of the DCA although it concluded that some amendments and clarifications were required. The DCA is in need of an update to recognise more realistic costs of care and to distinguish the different costs associated with different types of care.
186. **The IRP recommends that the DCA is maintained but there are two types of care identified to be paid at the following maximum rates:**
- **Child care:** maximum hourly rate paid at real living wage (currently £10.90)
 - **Elderly/disabled care:** maximum rate paid at the hourly rate charged by Trafford Council Social Services Department for a Home Carer
187. **The IRP also recommends that the current annual cap of £89 per week be discontinued and replaced by a cap of a maximum of 20 hours per week claimable. Also, all claims should continue to be to be receipted. Claims can be made where a carer is an informal babysitter as long as receipts are provided and they are not a member of the claimants household.**

Travel and Subsistence Allowances - Within the Council

188. Currently the Basic Allowance is deemed (with one exception) to include all travel and subsistence expenses incurred by Members while carrying out council related duties within the Council area, although this is not reflected in Schedule 2 of the scheme.
189. There was general agreement in the representation received that this is appropriate. The additional travel and subsistence expenses incurred by Members for undertaking in-Council, approved duties are so marginal that there is no justification to pay it, particularly considering the cost in Officer time that would be incurred in administering claims-based in-Council travel and subsistence allowances. Moreover, the logic of paying in-authority travel and subsistence allowances is less applicable now the Basic Allowance and SRA are not insignificant amounts. Moreover, it is common practice across the other GM Councils and indeed all urban councils to include all within authority travel and subsistence expenses in the Basic Allowance. The IRP agrees that situation should continue with two exceptions (see below).

190. **The IRP recommends that the Basic Allowance continues to be deemed inclusive of all in-Council travel and subsistence costs and that Schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is amended to reflect this situation.**

The Planning Development Control Travel Allowance - Within the Council

191. Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee are an exception to receiving no allowance for within authority travel. Each Member of the Committee receives a Planning Development Control Allowance of £423 per year. This travel allowance is to recognise that Members of the Planning & Development Management Committee are expected to undertake relevant site visits in their own time and as such travel costs are incurred that go beyond what is typical. It is paid as an annual sum to save on administration costs.
192. The IRP received no representation or evidence to change this approach but it did note that the annual sum was relatively minor, working out to be £35.25 per month. The IRP decided to uplift this to £40 per month or £480 per year.
193. **The IRP recommends that the Planning Development Control Travel Allowance is maintained and reset at £480 per year.**

Claiming Travel - Within the Council where there is a medical reason

194. One issue raised with the IRP was that where a Member had a medical reason, such as having a disability, to take a taxi to attend approved duties within the Council area which meant that a Member was incurring an in-authority travel expense that was more than marginal.
195. The IRP notes that in many local authorities where Members are not able to claim in-authority travel allowances, they make an exception where a Member has to attend an in-authority approved duty by taxi where they have a medical reason and are not able to drive or use public transport. The IRP also notes that disabilities legislation requires the Council to support any disabled Member to fulfil their roles.
196. **The IRP recommends that schedule 2 of the allowances scheme should be clarified to permit that where a Member is unable to attend an in-authority approved duty by car or public transport for medical reasons then they are exempt from the general prohibition by Members to claim in-authority travel allowances. In this case, they are able to claim travel expenses for attending in-authority approved duties if they have to travel by taxi.**

Subsistence Allowances - Outwith the Council

197. The scheme contains provision for Members to claim subsistence allowances when attending an approved duty outwith the Council. This is only appropriate as Members carrying out duties on behalf of the Council that go beyond the boundaries of Trafford should not be expected to pay for their own subsistence; it is normal practice in the public sector.

198. However, the subsistence allowance scheme has omissions in terms of allowances payable and lack of clarity how they should be claimed and in some of the rates payable. The principal omission is that there is no provision for claiming overnight accommodation. Although this is not a major issue as most Members never have to stay overnight outwith the Council on approved duties. Nonetheless, the scheme should set out such rates on the odd occasion it occurs. In setting an appropriate rate for overnight accommodation the IRP has adopted the rates that are payable in the Wigan scheme, which is £80 for absence from normal place of residence and where an absence overnight is required in London or at a Conference then the applicable rate is £90.

199. The Subsistence allowances scheme is not clear that the expectation should be that overnight accommodation and where possible accompanying subsistence should be pre-booked through Democratic Services and the subsistence and overnight accommodation rates are the maximum claimable rates when a Member is not able to pre-book and is seeking reimbursement of costs.

200. The other issue is that the claimable rates for Subsistence claims are low as they are based on historic rates that used to be applied to Officers as follows:

- Breakfast £4.48
- Lunch £6.17
- Tea £2.43
- Evening meal £7.64

201. The IRP has decided to aggregate the four categories of the meal subsistence rates which equates to £20.72 and set that sum as a maximum that a Member can claim for meals in any 24 hour period.

202. The IRP recommends that schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is clarified to state that where a Member is required to attend an approved duty outwith the Council then it is expected that where possible all relevant Subsistence and overnight accommodation should be pre-booked through Democratic Services. When this is not possible then the maximum rates can be claimed (all supported by receipts) are as follows

- **Meals allowance** **maximum of £20.72 within a 24 hour period**
- **Overnight accommodation** **maximum of £80**
- **Overnight accommodation** **maximum of £90**
(in London or at a Conference)

Travel Allowances - Outwith the Council

203. It is a different context when a Member has to travel outside the Council to represent the Council at regional and national meetings or attend conferences. In these cases Members are incurring expenses that are beyond 'incidental' and are not typically incurred through a Member's routine work.

204. However, again the travel allowance scheme has inconsistencies, omissions in terms of allowances payable and lack of clarity in how they should be claimed and

in some of the rates payable. The principal omission is that the mileage rates do not include the full range of HMRC rates and there is some inconsistency in the published rates. The scheme should also provide clarification that if a Member is claiming mileage by travel via a hybrid or electric vehicle then the normal HMRC mileage rates applies as clarified by the Office for Low Emission Vehicles.

- 205. The travel allowances scheme is not clear that the expectation should be that where possible all travel should be undertaken by public transport at standard rates and pre-booked through Democratic Services. Travel by vehicle should only be undertaken when no other means of travel is available or it is more cost effective to do so.
- 206. **The IRP recommends that schedule 2 of the allowances scheme is clarified to state that where a Member is required to attend an approved duty outwith the Council then it is expected that where possible travel should be on public transport at standards rates and should be pre-booked through Democratic Services. If travel by public transport is not possible or cost effective then the applicable mileage rates are applicable:**

Mode of Travel	First 10,000 business miles in the tax year	Each business mile over 10,000 miles in the tax year
Cars and vans (including Hybrid or Electric vehicles)	45p	25p
Motor cycles	24p	24p
Bicycles	20p	20p

Passenger payments – cars and vans

5p per passenger per business mile for carrying fellow Member or Council employee in a car or van (including hybrid/electric vehicles) up to a maximum of 5 passengers

Indexation

- 207. The 2003 Regulations (10 (4) permit “for an annual adjustment of allowances by reference to such index as may be specified by the authority” The 2003 Regulations 21 (1) (e) also require IRPs to make recommendations

as to whether adjustments to the level of allowances may be determined according to an index and if so which index and how long that index should apply, subject to a maximum of four years, before its application is reviewed;

- 208. There was overwhelming support in the representation received that the allowances continue to be indexed. Typically uplifting the allowances by an annual cost of living

index means that they do not lose relative value which in turn requires substantial periodic uplifts just to maintain their relative value. Moreover, the indexation of allowances is in place in almost all of the other GM Councils.

209. The main index that has historically been utilised by Trafford Council (and most other Councils) is the annual percentage increase in the salary of staff as agreed each year by the National Council for Local Government Staff, known as the NJC index. It has the advantage of being nationally agreed and ensures that Members and Officers are treated equally each year in their annual cost of living remuneration increase. The IRP received no evidence to change past practice.

210. **The IRP recommends that the following indices are applied to the allowances paid to Members and appointees of Trafford Council:**

- **Basic Allowance, SRAs (including those paid in accordance with the GMCA 2011 Order), Co-optees' and Subsistence Allowances:**
 - Indexed to the annual percentage salary increase for local government staff (*at spinal column point 43*) as agreed each year by the National Joint Council for Local Government Services and applicable to the same year it applies to Officers but with an implementation date from the start of the municipal rather than financial year.
- **Mileage Allowance (Outwith only):**
 - Members' mileage allowances rates indexed to HMRC Approved Mileage Allowance Payment rates.
- **The Dependants' Carers' Allowance:**
 - **Child care:** maximum hourly rate indexed to the real living wage
 - **Elderly/disabled care:** maximum rate indexed to the hourly rate charged by Trafford Council Social Services Department for a Home Carer

211. **The IRP also recommends that indexation should run for four years (2023-2027), which is the maximum length of time permitted by the 2003 Regulations. For authority for indexation to be extended beyond the fourth anniversary of the establishment of the new scheme of allowances the Council is required to first seek advice from the IRP.**

Implementation

212. **The IRP recommends that the recommendations contained in this report are adopted from the 1st April 2023.**

APPENDIX ONE - Information reviewed by the IRP

1. IRP terms of reference
2. Review of Members' Allowances for Trafford Council, IRP Report May 2007
3. Extract from Council minutes relating to Council decision regarding recommendations of IRP Report May 2007, 23 May 2007
4. Review of Members' Allowances for Trafford Council, IRP Report September 2014
5. Extract from Council minutes relating to Council decision regarding recommendations of IRP Report September 2014, 17 September 2014
6. Review of Members' Allowances for Trafford Council, IRP Report July 2018
7. Extract from Council minutes relating to Council decision regarding recommendations of IRP Report July 2018, 25 July 2018
8. Trafford Council Members' Allowances Scheme, 2022/23
9. Trafford Council statutory publication of allowances & expenses paid under the allowances scheme 2021/22
10. Terms of Reference for Council, Committees, Panels, etc.
11. Schedule of Council, Committee, Panel, etc., Meetings 2022/23
12. Membership of Cabinet, Committees, Panels, political makeup of the Council, etc.
13. Executive Member role profiles
14. Consultation of elected Members on Trafford Council Members' Allowances Scheme – feedback from Members based on short questionnaire sent out to all Members – 26 responses received
15. New Council Constitutions: Guidance on Regulation for Local Authority Allowances, May 2006 (extract)
16. Benchmarking data - BM1-4 - allowances paid across the Greater Manchester Councils 2022/23
17. Hard copies of allowances schemes (2021/22) from the councils included in the benchmarking group
18. Statutory Instrument 2003 No. 1021, The Local Authorities (Members' Allowances) (England) Regulations 2003
19. National Joint Council for local government services, Local Government Services' Pay Agreement 2022/23, 1 November 2022, Page 3 – shows

4.04% increase at SCP 43

20. Office for Low Emissions Vehicles, Ultra Low Emission Vehicles Tax Benefits, 2018
21. National Census of Local Authority Councillors 2018 (LGA), breakdown of weekly hours by councillors by number of positions held and type of council, in email from S. Richards, LGA 21 October 2019.
22. Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings (ASHE), Average weekly earnings (excluding overtime) all full time employees, Trafford Council area, (work geography), Table 7.2a, October 2022
23. Greater Manchester Allowances – report approved by the Leaders at the Combined Authority meeting on 16 December 2022 asking Trafford and the other GM councils to agree to make pay SRAs to Members appointed to the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee and to formally adopt the decision to enable the Council to make the payments to Scrutiny members.
24. PowerPoint training presentation by IRP Chair, Reviewing Allowances: Context and the Trafford Remuneration Model – Patterns, Issues and Options

APPENDIX TWO - Member Interviewees**Members and Appointees who met the IRP (31st January – 1st February 2023)**

1. Cllr D. Acton: Chair of Scrutiny Committee (Labour)
2. Cllr J. Axford: Labour Member
3. Cllr L. Blackburn: Leader of Main (Conservative) Opposition Group, Shadow Executive Member for Children's Services, Shadow Lead for Education and Vice Chair of Children & Young People's Scrutiny Committee
4. Cllr D. Chalkin: Deputy Leader of Conservative Group, Shadow Executive Member for Climate Change & Transport Strategy plus Housing & Neighbourhoods, Opposition Spokesperson for Employment Committee plus Planning & Development Committee
5. Cllr W. Frass: Liberal Democrat Member
6. Cllr C. Hynes: Deputy Leader of the Council (Labour) & Executive Member for Children's Services
7. Cllr D. Jarman: Chair of Licensing Committee (Labour)
8. Cllr J. Lloyd: Vice Chair of Accounts & Audit Committee (Labour)
9. Cllr J. Newgrosh: Leader of Minority Opposition Group (Liberal Democrat)
10. Cllr K. Proctor: Chair of Standards Committee (Labour)
11. Cllr T. Ross: Leader of the Council and Labour Group and GMCA Member
12. Cllr S. Thomas: Vice Chair of Licensing Committee (Labour)
13. Cllr M. Welton: Deputy Leader Green Group
14. Cllr M. Whetton: Chair of Health Scrutiny Committee (Conservative)
15. Cllr A. Williams: Executive Member for Climate Change & Transport
16. Cllr B. Winstanley: Vice Chair Planning & Development Committee (Labour)

APPENDIX THREE - Officer Briefings

John Addison:	Governance Manager & Statutory Scrutiny Officer
Ian Cockill:	Senior Governance Officer
Dominique Sykes:	Director of Legal & Governance & Monitoring Officer
Sara Todd:	Chief Executive

APPENDIX FOUR – Benchmarking Allowances paid across the Greater Manchester Councils

BM1 Trafford Council BM Group - Other GM Mets: BA + Exec + Scrutiny SRAs (22/23)										
Comparator Council	Basic Allowance	Leader or Elected Mayor	Leader or Elected Mayor GMCA SRA	Leader Total	Deputy Leader	Executive Members	Assistant or Deputy Execs	Chairs or Lead Scrutiny	V/Chairs Scrutiny	Chairs Scrutiny Subs/WGs
Bolton	£11,644	£31,294		£42,938	£18,775	£7,140		£5,100		
Bury	£10,791	£32,373	£6,000	£49,164	£19,424	£14,568	£2,185	£8,093		
Manchester	£18,841	£47,016		£65,857	£19,775	£19,775	£7,913	£11,877		
Oldham*	£10,151	£30,453	£6,089	£46,693	£21,317	£18,272	£7,613	£9,135		
Rochdale	£11,172	£33,516	£5,879	£50,567	£16,758	£15,082	£3,016	£8,379		
Salford*	£12,012	£59,817		£71,829	£24,930	£15,932	£11,626	£9,432	£3,141	
Stockport	£10,717	£32,151		£42,868	£17,683	£16,075		£6,430		£1,286
Tameside	£14,712	£39,588		£54,300	£25,812	£22,081	£9,176	£10,526	£3,509	£2,601
Wigan	£13,920	£42,500	£10,237	£66,657	£27,147	£18,818	£6,210	£8,364		
Trafford*	£7,061	£28,246	£10,432	£45,739	£19,770	£14,122	£7,060	£8,473	£4,236	
Mean	£12,102	£37,695	£7,727	£53,661	£21,139	£16,187	£6,850	£8,581	£3,629	
Median	£11,408	£32,945	£6,089	£49,866	£19,773	£16,004	£7,337	£8,426	£3,509	
Highest	£18,841	£59,817	£10,432	£71,829	£27,147	£22,081	£11,626	£11,877	£4,236	
Lowest	£7,061	£28,246	£5,879	£42,868	£16,758	£7,140	£2,185	£5,100	£3,141	
Mean Ratios	Leader = 3.1 X BA	100%			56%	43%	42%	23%	42%	
Trafford Ratios	4				70%	50%	50%	30%	50%	

* Oldham + Salford has 2 Deputy Leaders/Mayors

BM2 Trafford BM Group Other GM Mets : Regulatory SRAs (22/23)										
Comparator Council	Chair of Planning	V/Chair of Planning	Chair of Licensing	V/Chair Licensing	Chairs Liquor Licensing Panels/Subs	Mbrs Licensing	Chair of Audit &/or Governance	V/Chair Audit	Chair Standards	Chair Employment
Bolton	£8,177	£2,813	£7,740	£2,521						
Bury	£8,093		£8,093				£8,093			
Manchester	£11,877	£3,961	£11,877	£3,961		£596				
Oldham	£9,135		£9,135						£709	
Rochdale	£11,172		Inc in Planning				£8,379			£8,379
Salford	£9,432	£3,141	£9,432	£3,141			£9,432	£3,141		
Stockport	£8,038		£4,823		£3,858		£3,858			
Tameside	£10,526	£3,509	£6,809	£2,536	£6,809		£10,526	£3,509	£6,809	
Wigan	£12,543	£3,265	£15,491	£3,873			£8,364			
Trafford	£11,298	£4,236	£11,298	£4,236	£3,591		£8,473	£4,236	£2,496	£8,473
Mean	£10,029	£3,488	£9,411	£3,378	£4,753		£8,161	£3,629	£3,338	
Median	£9,979	£3,387	£9,135	£3,507	£3,858		£8,379	£3,509	£2,496	
Highest	£12,543	£4,236	£15,491	£4,236	£6,809		£10,526	£4,236	£6,809	
Lowest	£8,038	£2,813	£4,823	£2,521	£3,591		£3,858	£3,141	£709	
Mean Ratios Leaders' or Chairs' SRA	27%	35%	25%	36%	51%		22%	44%	9%	
Trafford Ratios	40%	37%	40%	37%	32%		30%	50%	9%	

BM3 Trafford BM Group - Other GM Mets: Opposition, Group & Other SRAs (22/23)								
Comparator Council	Main Opposition Leader	Main Opposition Deputy Leader	Opposition Lead or Shadow Exec	Other Opposition Group Leaders	Other Opposition Group Deputy Leaders	Area Chairs	> 1 SRA Paid	Other Political/Group SRAs
Bolton	£10,555	£6,333		£2,940			No	Chair Bolton Cares £8,050, Bolton at Home £5,500
Bury	£10,683	£4,273		£2,671	£1,870		No	
Manchester	£11,877	£4,752		£4,752			No	Opposition Lead Mbr Finance £1,188, City Centre Spokesperson + Member on Fostering Panel £7,913, Member on Adoption Panel £6,372. Members of Licensing only paid if attend >12 meetings
Oldham	£15,227	£6,091	£3,045			£1,257 - £6,396	No	2 Joint Opposition Leaders + Opposition Deputy Leaders
Rochdale	£11,731			£1,676		£8,379	No	Member Adoption + Fostering Panels £1,676
Salford	£9,432			£9,432			No	Opposition Group Leaders SRA only payable with 3 Members
Stockport	£9,645			£1,101 + £330 p/Mbr		£4,823	No	
Tameside	£12,381			£2,536		£10,526	No	Chair Council Business £12,381, Dep Chairs Licensing Subs £2,536, Dep Area Chairs £3,509, Dep Chair Standards £2,536, Member Standards £1,665 + if attend .5 Standards Hearings £100 p/meeting
Wigan	£5,641	£50 p/Member if > 15 Members		£5,641			No	
Trafford	£14,122	£2,823	£2,823	£2,823			Yes 2nd SRA paid @ 50%	Lead Member Education £8,473, Shadow Lead Education £1,729, Shadow Dep Exec Mbrs £1,410 (Only paid if 25% of Council Member inc. Main Opposition Leader) Opposition Spokespersons (Planning & Licensing) £2,823, V/Chair Employment £4,236, Social Services Visits £664, Planning Travel £423
Mean	£11,129	£4,854		£4,059		£7,909		
Median	£11,207	£4,752		£2,882		£8,379		
Highest	£15,227	£6,333		£9,432		£10,526		
Lowest	£5,641	£2,823		£1,676		£4,823		
Mean Ratios to Leaders' SRA	30%	44%		11%		21%		
Trafford Ratios	50%	20%	20%	10%				

